



This work has been submitted to **NECTAR**, the **Northampton Electronic Collection of Theses and Research**.

Conference or Workshop Item

Title: The UK's first professional symphony orchestra cooperative: social enterprise?

Creators: Seddon, F. A., Hazenberg, R. and Denny, S.

Example citation: Seddon, F. A., Hazenberg, R. and Denny, S. (2013) The UK's first professional symphony orchestra cooperative: social enterprise? Paper presented to: *5th International Social Innovation Research Conference (ISIRC), Oxford, 02-04 September 2013.*

Version: Presented version

<http://nectar.northampton.ac.uk/5853/>



**5th International Social Innovation Research Conference (ISIRC) Said Business School,
University of Oxford, 2-4 September 2013**

Authors: Dr Fred Seddon, Dr Richard Hazenberg and Prof. Simon Denny, School Of Social Sciences, Northampton University, UK

Title: The UK's first professional symphony orchestra cooperative: Social Enterprise?

Abstract

This conference paper reports the results of the first phase of a three phase longitudinal research study designed to examine the initiation and development of the UK's first professional symphony orchestra cooperative. Semi-structured interviews were conducted with thirty six professional musicians from a 'pool' of forty plus musicians. This 'pool' of musicians provides the cooperative with a resource that can be drawn on to form an orchestra to rehearse for and perform concerts and recordings. Preliminary results reveal four themes that emerged from the semi-structured interview data. These themes were interpreted by the researchers as: 'commitment', 'democracy', 'social mission' and 'aesthetic aspirations'. The themes are presented along with supporting quotations from the interview data that illustrate the characteristics of these four emergent themes. The implications of the themes are then discussed within the context of the prior literature reviewed.

Introduction

There is evidence to support the notion that there is a reciprocal relationship between the provision of cultural experiences and the wellbeing of society (Dubina, 2013; National Endowment for the Arts, 2007). Historically, the provision of cultural experience in society is significantly influenced by financial contributions made by the state and private philanthropy, which has resulted in the providers of cultural experiences becoming reliant upon subsidy (Mariani and Zan, 2011). This reliance upon subsidy has left the providers of cultural experience subject to the prevailing economic and political climate in their recipient societies (Mariani and Zan, 2011). Professional symphony orchestras provide music cultural experiences for society and are responsible for maintaining historical and developing new musical culture (Pompe, Tamburri and Munn, 2011). In the current global financial crisis, levels of financial subsidy for professional symphony orchestras from state and philanthropy are declining resulting in a reduction of the number of professional symphony orchestras. In the current financial climate larger symphony orchestras, situated in major cities are able to survive more easily than smaller regional symphony orchestras, which means that population groups in society without access to these larger symphony orchestras may become culturally deprived (Dubina, 2013). Surviving professional symphony orchestras find that artistic and aesthetic decisions, such as choice of repertoire and the development of the art form, are being overly influenced by financial constraints imposed upon the management of those orchestras (Pompe, Tamburri and Munn, 2011). Management decisions on artistic and aesthetic matters directly impact upon the job satisfaction of the orchestral musicians and can influence their career decisions and choice of orchestra (Smith and Murphy, 1984). Furthermore, as a result of current financial constraints, professional symphony orchestras must broaden their revenue generating activities and this situation is beginning to impact on the governance of professional symphony orchestras (Rosenbaum, 2011). A professional symphony orchestra based in Reading, UK, '*Sinfonia Musicisti*' has reacted to current

pressures by changing the governance of their orchestra and forming a producer cooperative (or not-for-profit mutual) in order to assist in securing its future financial security and facilitate more democratic, artistic and aesthetic decision making. *Sinfonia Musicisti* is the focus of the current research study that is the subject of this conference paper. The paper will begin by reviewing the relevant literature around the relationship between the prevailing political, economic climate and provision of cultural experiences. The literature review will examine how the current global financial crisis has impacted upon the governance of professional symphony orchestras and how this can impact upon the orchestral musicians involved. The review will also examine the rationale behind how some orchestras may look towards social enterprise as a way of securing their financial futures and assisting them to support their dual role of preserving and developing musical culture for the enrichment of society. The paper will continue by outlining the longitudinal current research project being conducted with *Sinfonia Musicisti* and report on the findings of the first phase of this research study. Finally, the preliminary results of the study will be presented and discussed in relation to the prior research reviewed in the literature review.

Literature review

The positive impact of art on society is expressed by the Arts Council, England on their website:

“Great art and culture inspires us, brings us together and teaches us about ourselves and the world around us. In short, it makes life better.” (Arts Council, England, 2013).

Professional symphony orchestras play a significant role in providing an important cultural, social and economic service to society and any reduction in the number of professional symphony orchestras will result in society being less enriched by the benefits derived from cultural experience (Dubina, 2013). Evidence supporting this viewpoint has been demonstrated by prior research, which found a correlation between attendances at performing arts events and increased health and heightened community involvement and volunteerism (National Endowment for the Arts, 2007). This perception of the positive influence the performing arts has on society is supported by the prior willingness of governments, companies and philanthropists to provide financial support for them. This financial support has obvious benefits but can result in performing artists becoming too reliant on it for their survival. Prior research into symphony orchestra organisation reveals a history of long-term reliance upon state and/or regional subsidy or company and/or individual philanthropy to secure the continuity of professional symphony orchestras (Mariani and Zan, 2011). However, in the current global financial crisis, these sources of financial support for orchestras are declining. Set against this, labour costs associated with the production of artistic performance continue to increase and productivity remains unchanged resulting in financial difficulties for the orchestra (Besana, 2012).

Prior research into political systems and orchestra governance (Hannan and Freeman, 1977, 1989; Aldrich, 1979; Tushman and Anderson, 1986; Allmendinger, 1990; Zimmer, 1990; Möller, 1991; Mehner, 1990; Allmendinger and Hackman, 1996) described how political and financial policies impacted on German symphony orchestras during two different political periods (post WW2 and post reunification). Socialist policies in East Germany post WW2 sought to increase music cultural experience in society and the number of orchestras

increased from 48-76 as the state sought to bring German musical tradition to all the people (Mehner, 1990). The East German state implemented low wages for orchestral musicians (four times less than players in West German orchestras) but also introduced flat wage structures and job security, which resulted in positive relationships between the musicians and increased their job satisfaction. When the political system changed after reunification, supporting the increased number of orchestras proved to be financially unsustainable and differentiation within orchestras (e.g., principal players earned substantially more than section players) and between orchestras emerged. In the post reunification political system, some orchestras flourished and others ceased to exist. The more successful orchestras had players who became involved in the organisation of the orchestra.

Orchestral musician's willingness to become involved in the organisation of their orchestra can be driven by aesthetic and financial motivations mediated by individual feelings of job satisfaction. Ironically, many musicians begin their musical training expecting to live out a rich and creative life but find that having trained for solo performance, playing in a symphony orchestra is perceived as a disappointment (Sternbach, 1993b; Mogelof and Rohrer, 2005). Some orchestral musicians regard their playing as more of a 'job' than a fulfilment of their 'passion' (Atik, 1992). As a result, orchestral musicians stopped thinking about contributing to administrative and financial decisions and repertoire choice because the management offered limited (if any) promotion or organisational involvement (Brodksy, 2006). Management decisions over the choice of repertoire may be influenced by advancing the art form but repertoire choices are more likely to be influenced by the necessity to generate revenue, which can produce a conflict between programming innovative compositions and income generation. Therefore, the reduction of grants and donations for symphony orchestras in the current economic downturn has led to greater conventionality in programming in an attempt to maintain the audience base (Pompe, Tamburri and Munn, 2011). This conventionality can influence musicians to take positions in less prestigious orchestras because they find the musical work more interesting (Smith and Murphy, 1984). Sometimes musicians are prepared to work for less money than they could potentially earn in more prestigious orchestras because of their emotional commitment to the genre (Cornwall and Perlman, 1990). This emotional commitment is an intangible aspect of working in an artistic environment along with others such as interpersonal relationships, for example, friendship and informality (Brkic, 2009). If during the current period of financial constraint, lesser known symphony orchestras are to survive and musical culture is to be both preserved and developed, traditional autocratic governance of orchestras needs to change to a more democratic form of governance that can encourage collective enterprise.

Prior research has identified nonprofit arts organisations as social enterprises (Social Enterprise Alliance USA, 2011; Pomerantz, 2006; Brkic, 2009; Palmer, 1998; Dimaggio, 1987). More than 90% of American orchestras, opera companies and chamber groups are nonprofits (Hager, 2001). Therefore, at a time of shrinking financial subsidy, the entrepreneurial activities of performing arts organisations are crucial to their survival (Rosenbaum, 2011; Di Domenico, Haugh and Tracey, 2010). The advantages of generating revenue through trading rather than receiving subsidy are: autonomy, the flexibility to adapt to the needs of the local community and the potential to apply innovative business models (Austin, Stevenson, and Wei-Skillern, 2006; Borzaga and Defourny, 2001). Prior research by Di Domenico, Haugh and Tracey, (2010) established a theoretical framework of social bricolage with the key constructs of, 'making do', 'a refusal to be constrained by limitations', 'improvisation', 'social value creation', 'stakeholder participation' and 'persuasion'. According to Di Domenico, Haugh and Tracey (2010), 'Making do' is when bricoleurs

acquire resources and they recombine them in novel ways to solve problems and respond to opportunities. 'Refusal to be constrained by limitations' is when bricoleurs respond to increasing pressures with creative responses such as generating new revenue streams to replace funding cuts. 'Improvisation' is applying creative thinking to adapt standard ways of working initiating a range of projects to overcome the constraints of limited resources. 'Social value creation' is what social enterprises do by creating a tactical response to resource scarcity. 'Stakeholder participation' is the involvement of stakeholders in the creation, management and governance of their social enterprise. 'Persuasion' means harnessing social assets such as friendship, liking, trust, obligation and gratitude in co-opting resources into an entrepreneurial venture. Stakeholder-based governance structure of social enterprises is at the heart of persuasion and can result in increased autonomy leading to a reduction in the reliance on grants and donations (Di Domenico, Haugh and Tracey, 2010). Performing arts organisations can take a bricolage perspective to achieve financial sustainability by applying resourcefulness and adaptability to deploy strategies such as new organisational combinations (Ciborra, 1996) and refuse to be constrained by the resource limitations imposed by institutional and/or political settings (Baker and Nelson, 2005; Weick, 1995). Orchestras have a 'product' that bears some similarity to a public good, they often receive a subsidy from the state and their players aspire to having a 'voice' or influencing the nature of the service provided. These criteria fulfil those for forming a producer co-op (or a not for profit mutual) (Spear, 2000). Cooperatives exist to serve their members and to reduce inequalities amongst members enabling them to monitor the enterprise, communicate amongst themselves and make collective decisions (Spear, 2000). In addition to these qualities cooperatives espouse the ethical values of self-help, democracy, equality, equity and solidarity and the principles of openness, autonomy and independence, education and concern for the community (Spear, 2000).

The current research

The professional symphony orchestra involved in this research study has taken the unique step of forming a cooperative to try to secure the financial future for the orchestra and to support the continuing provision and development of classical music culture for all sectors of society. The current research examines motivations and expectations of the musicians in the newly formed orchestral cooperative. It also seeks to plot the changes in the musicians' motivations, expectations, financial and aesthetic outcomes and social impact over a two year period as the orchestra is initiated, developed and consolidated. The research methodology is longitudinal, employing a mixed quantitative, qualitative design. There will be three data collection points: 1) 'initiation'; 2) 'development'; and 3) 'consolidation'. Data collection at all three points in time will include qualitative and quantitative data. Qualitative data will be collected through individual, semi-structured interviews with the 40+ 'pool' of professional freelance musicians designed to elicit their motivations, expectations and reflections on their experiences as they initiate, develop and consolidate their symphony orchestra cooperative. Quantitative data will document numbers of concerts played, audience numbers, ticket receipts and financial outcomes for the musicians and the cooperative. Social impact will be sought from audience members through a questionnaire to be administered at concert venues and other performance events. All interviews will be recorded and transcribed for analysis employing qualitative analysis procedures based on 'Grounded Theory' and results of this qualitative analysis will be triangulated with the results from the analysis of the quantitative data from the cooperative's financial records and the audience survey. The process of 'member checks' will be conducted with key members of the orchestra to ensure researcher interpretations of the qualitative data represent the musicians 'view of reality'.

Research questions:

RQ1: To reveal the motivations and expectations of the orchestral musicians as they form a professional symphony orchestra cooperative.

RQ2: To reveal the aesthetic impact of the cooperative governance on the orchestra's performances.

RQ3: To plot the financial success of the cooperative.

RQ4: To measure the social impact of the cooperative.

Method

Participants

The Cooperative Orchestra

The cooperative orchestra is called *Sinfonia Musicisti* and is based in Reading, UK. The cooperative has a pool of 44 freelance professional musicians that can be called upon to form a symphony orchestra to rehearse for and perform concerts. The orchestra will also produce audio and visual recordings that can be marketed to raise income for the cooperative. The governance structure of the orchestra is an Industrial Providence Society (IPS), which is basically a co-operative registered as a limited company. The IPS has the ability to engage supporters who are able to invest time and/or money in the company. There is a board of five members (soon to be increased to six) who hold board meetings at which various management tasks are distributed between board members. In the future, members of the co-operative will also be asked to help with these tasks. Booking orchestral concerts is a specialised task and the cooperative hopes to employ an experienced professional to handle concert bookings in the future but at this 'initiation' phase of the research board members are responsible for concert bookings.

Procedure

During this 'initiation' phase of the research study, 36 of the 44 musicians forming the 'pool' of musicians were involved in individual semi-structured interviews with a researcher. Because the musicians lived over a wide geographical area and had busy lifestyles, interviews were conducted with a researcher via the telephone. The length of the interviews ranged from 48m.00s to 10m. 21s. All 36 interviews were recorded and transcribed for analysis.

Analysis

The interview transcripts are in the process of being subjected to qualitative analysis procedures based upon 'Grounded Theory'. Currently, 52 'units of analysis' have been identified and the following four 'preliminary themes' have emerged from the 'units of analysis', which were interpreted by the researchers as: 'commitment', 'democracy', 'social mission' and 'aesthetic aspirations'.

Results

This paper reports the preliminary results of the first phase of the research study ‘initiation’ only. The following quotations from the semi-structured interview data characterise the emergent themes.

Theme A ‘commitment’

The musicians expressed their levels of commitment to the cooperative, which fell broadly into three levels that were interpreted as: 1) total commitment, 2) reserved commitment and 3) no commitment. As might be expected, the cooperative board members tended to be the most committed. Some non-board member players were also totally committed but others had reservations and a few players had very little or no commitment. The following quotations exemplify the range of levels of commitment expressed by the participant musicians.

Total commitment

“We are not robots, we are not just people working in an office, we are creative people and we like to express ourselves. We are very expressive and I think that's the attraction of it all that we can form a cooperative. No one's experienced this [situation] of everybody having a collective say. I think it's all about us taking control of our lives rather than being at the mercy of other people.” (P29)

Reserved commitment

“In an orchestra not organised as a cooperative, obviously lots of choices get made that the musicians don't get any say in. It will be interesting to see if the musicians get more say in this set up. I suppose there is a chance that being a cooperative will have a small degree of influence. I don't think that it will actually have an enormous degree because I think that simply logistically, those kinds of decisions will on the whole, have to be taken by somebody. That's the same regardless of what kind of set up you have.” (P5)

No commitment

“Well I'm not actually a member, I'm just being asked to play. So, I'd have to say because I'm a freelance musician who needs money, and if they're offering the money then it means it's a good offer. Sorry for a bit of a cold answer, but it's kind of reality. As long as I'm being offered work, I'm freelance after all; if they offer work it's very difficult to say no to it.” (P23)

Of the 44 musicians that form the ‘pool’ of musicians involved in the orchestral cooperative, 36 responded to being asked to engage in an interview. The researchers interpreted the interviewee’s levels of commitment to the cooperative based upon comments made by them during the interviews. The results of these interpretations are presented in Table 1 and indicate the distribution of interviewees by commitment to the cooperative at this ‘initial’ phase of the research. The researchers felt it was not possible to accurately interpret the level of commitment for three of the interviewees (15, 22, 36) so these three participants do not appear in Table 1. Also, eight of the 44 ‘pool’ of musicians declined to be interviewed, which

leaves the commitment level of 11 of the ‘pool’ unaccounted for but can reasonably be interpreted as lacking commitment.

Table 1: Commitment to the cooperative

Level of Commitment	Participants	Total
Total commitment	29, 1, 6, 12, 24, 25, 8, 2, 4, 32, 5, 7, 18, 19, 9 20, 21	17
Reserved commitment	34, 3, 26, 30, 11, 27, 10, 14, 17	9
No commitment	23, 31, 28, 33, 13, 16, 35	7

Theme B ‘democracy’

There was a recurring emergent theme of democracy. Musicians talked about having a sense of ownership and having the opportunity to influence the organisation of the orchestra. There was also a perception of reduced fear of the orchestra management, having a sense of team spirit and willingness to play for reduced fees to help the cooperative establish itself.

“The members have a sense, of well, not just a sense of ownership of the thing, but a very real ownership of it really. And you know it's democratically run, people have a voice in the decision making. I mean actually there is a sense in which you kind of buy into it,” (P20)

“But it has given me a sense of ownership of the orchestra in a way that I don't necessarily feel with other orchestras. In terms of my relationship with the other players in the orchestra for example, within a woodwind section I play the oboe and you would sit in your chair and play your part and you'd stay on that part. And I'm normally second oboe but the principle oboe of Sinfonia Musicisti has very kindly said that this is a cooperative orchestra, we're all kind of all in it together, why don't we do some swapping from time to time? So we both ended up playing on different parts at different times and that's made me kind of feel grateful to her and kind of valued by her and the rest of the section.” (P4)

“Okay when you are working with an orchestra of which you are not a member. I tend to find I am constantly looking over my shoulder, a little bit concerned about if I'm doing absolutely everything right, and I'm not upsetting anybody either, and they're not going to be able to criticise my playing. A small element of fear a lot of the time and you might not be asked again.” (P3)

“The community organisation is that I feel there is more openness between players. There's more, you have more right to speak or you feel you can talk to what we call maybe management or our committee in our case. Whereas, if I'm in another orchestra situation or another freelance situation, I never dare try to say what I want or what I wanted from the orchestra for the fear of not ever being asked again. So this is much more a community where I feel I'm heard and don't run the risk of anybody saying ‘Why did she say that?’ or ‘We had better not book her again because she's a danger or she's a troublemaker’. I feel I can say things, what I think should be said and it'll be taken in and people are talking to each other without having to be afraid that there's a hierarchy of people, you know of players or management pushing you

out. So it's a nice feeling, it's a nice feeling of thinking 'Oh there's something, there's a community, we all want the same. We all want music, we want to play. We want to try and earn some money and play good music and we're all in the same position' and that makes it a nice feeling." (P10)

"We could probably, you know, push our fee aside for maybe a concert or two just to get it [the cooperative] moving. I think people would probably be willing [to do that], the sort of hardcore anyway. I think there are some players who still see it just as another professional job and haven't quite grasped the ethos. But I think they're coming round to it, the more." (P14)

Many of the participant musicians expressed a responsibility to make good quality music available to as wide an audience as possible. The musicians expressed a belief that access to their music enriched individuals' lives and society in general, which could be described as their social mission.

Theme C: 'social mission'

Many of the participant musicians were motivated to bring classical music to disadvantaged communities that for geographical or financial reasons don't have access to it.

"Yeah, I mean we are very supportive of trying to get high quality live music out there as often as we can and wherever we can. And feeling that it is accessible to people of all walks of life, and people who live in all types of communities, and if this is a practical means by which you can make it financially possible, that has got to be the ultimate goal hasn't it." (P6)

Participant musicians also expressed the importance of involving children in their music making in an attempt to broaden the children's cultural horizons. This experience was based upon a particular event where children were invited to attend a rehearsal in their local area and were given the opportunity to stand by musicians in the orchestra to enable the children to experience the music from the orchestral musician's perspective.

"At one of the concerts I did with the orchestra there were some local school children that came to watch the rehearsal and then actually stood among us. So, as we played one of the pieces they could really feel part of the orchestra. It's by becoming a part of the community that people get to know about an orchestra and feel if they're not necessarily knowledgeable or used to listening to classical music they feel like they know what they're coming to see and it's a way of building audiences as well as giving something back to community groups regardless of age." (P4)

This kind of activity exemplifies the social mission of the orchestral cooperative and how the cooperative governance of the orchestra facilitates their socially orientated activities.

"It's [working with children] the sort of thing that reminds the community what we are generally setting out to do if you like, and it's not just about making money for the professional." (P11)

"That can be our decision with our money to fund an event to give others the opportunity to experience music that they might not be able to pay for it or won't have

access to it. I think we should kind of act as a slightly charitable organisation to do that, and I think that's probably according to all of us.” (P21)

Theme D ‘aesthetic aspiration’

This theme was characterised by the musicians talking about experiences of ‘Empathetic Creativity’ [a term proposed in Seddon, 2004, 2005, 2012; Seddon and Biasutti 2009a, 2009b) to describe the non-verbal creative communication between musicians during rehearsal and performance]. The musicians also discussed the potential to have a collaborative choice of repertoire and a more democratic relationship with the conductor with even the possibility of playing without a conductor.

“Certainly the musicians around me, we're starting to get to know each other very well and we're starting to get to know each other's playing and we're starting to enjoy [playing]. [name of the conductor], who is conducting us, he's aware that we are keen to be able to be as expressive as possible and I think he is allowing the orchestra to grow organically in a way and be able to, yeah, be able to communicate musically with each other in the same way as an ensemble would, so the people really start to play. I think what you'll notice in that situation is that your players will play far better. You'll get a much more exciting performance in the end because people will really play and perform rather than just play, they'll perform, and I think that will be the big difference ultimately.” (P32)

“I think one of the most interesting things is to be able to have the participation in artistic decisions. Because most of the orchestras, actually every orchestra I've played with, do not have any [opportunity for] artistic decision [making]. You just play what you are told to play, being able to actually have an input on the artistic direction of the orchestra. [For example] If you go to an orchestra and you don't like the conductor then there's nothing you can do. But I believe in this orchestra there could be a consensus or there could be at least a way where you could actually say look, I don't think this is working with this particular conductor or I think you know, things like that. I think that's a very interesting, that's a very interesting thing” (P7)

“I mean I think it would be an exciting prospect for the orchestra to try at some point in its future, to actually work without a conductor.” (P19)

Discussion

The emergent themes from the semi-structured interviews demonstrate that, at this ‘initiation’ phase of the research study, although the cooperative has now been established the individual members of the cooperative displayed differing levels of commitment to it. Those musicians displaying total commitment to the cooperative lend support to prior research that demonstrated cooperatives exist to serve their members, reduce inequalities and increase motivation to communicate amongst themselves in order to make collective decisions when monitoring the progress of the cooperative (Spear, 2000). It will be interesting to track changes in the overall levels of musician commitment, as the research study progresses, to reveal any potential relationship between that commitment and the success of the orchestra in both financial and aesthetic terms. The feelings of democracy expressed by the participant musicians revealed their enthusiasm to be involved in decision making, which lends support to prior research reporting that when not included in decision making, orchestral musicians can become less motivated and perceive their involvement in the orchestra as a ‘job’ and not a fulfilment of their ‘passion’ (Atik, 1992; Brodsky, 2006). Player involvement in orchestra

organisation could lead to the orchestra being more successful in the future as demonstrated by prior research (Hannan and Freeman, 1977, 1989; Aldrich, 1979; Tushman and Anderson, 1986; Allmendinger, 1990; Zimmer, 1990; Möller, 1991; Mehner, 1990; Allmendinger and Hackman, 1996). It will be interesting to discover at later phases in the research study if this is the case. The reduced levels of fear and willingness to play for reduced fees described by some of the musicians in the theme 'democracy' resonates with the low wages, flat wage structures and job security that promoted positive relationships and job satisfaction for orchestral musicians in post WW2 East Germany (Hannan and Freeman, 1977, 1989; Aldrich, 1979; Tushman and Anderson, 1986; Allmendinger, 1990; Zimmer, 1990; Möller, 1991; Mehner, 1990; Allmendinger and Hackman, 1996).

It should be recognised that one of the primary motivations of the musicians in forming the orchestra cooperative must be to create opportunities for their own employment and income. However, the opportunity to provide a 'product' that bears some similarity to a public good (Spear, 2000) was also a powerful motivator and was revealed in Theme C: 'social mission'. Theme C was characterised by the musicians' aspirations to make their music available to all sections of society regardless of geographical location and ability to pay. Participant musicians talked about a sense of responsibility to bring classical music to disadvantaged members of society exemplified by the opportunity they provided for young children to experience the sensation of being 'inside' a symphony orchestra during one of their rehearsals. This 'inside' experience for the children provided them with the opportunity to understand the classical music experience, which can broaden their musical horizons. This 'social mission' described by the participant musicians exemplifies their ethical values related to education and concern for the community (Spear, 2000) and supports the proposal that the orchestral cooperative is a social enterprise.

The findings of this 'initiation' phase of the research project resonate with the theory of social bricolage (Di Domenico, Haugh and Tracey, 2010). The musicians' actions in forming a cooperative can be described as 'making do' because they are combining their resources in a novel way to solve the problem of diminishing subsidy and responding to new opportunities. The musicians are demonstrating a 'refusal to be constrained by limitations' by attempting to generate new revenue streams to replace diminishing funding opportunities as a result of financial constraint. The reconfiguration of the governance of the orchestra as a cooperative demonstrates 'improvisation' by applying creative thinking. The orchestra is creating a tactical response to the scarcity of music cultural experiences in some sections of society, which demonstrates 'social value creation'. There is stakeholder participation for the musicians, demonstrated in the cooperative nature of the orchestra and the development of future audiences in the orchestra's commitment to working with young people in local communities. 'Persuasion' is evident in the way the musicians are harnessing social assets such as friendship, liking, trust, obligation and gratitude in co-opting resources into an entrepreneurial venture. In this case, the cooperative orchestra may be described as a social enterprise seeking to increase its autonomy and reduce its reliance upon grants and donations. This finding lends support through providing a practical example of social bricolage (Di Domenico, Haugh and Tracey, 2010).

References

Aldrich, H.E. (1979) *Organisations and Environments*, Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall

- Allmendinger, J. (1990) Die Kunst des Überlebens oder das Überleben der Kunst? Frankfurter Rundschau, Nr 299 (December 24) S. 26
- Allmendinger, J. and Hackman, J.R. (1996) Organisations in changing environments: The case of East German symphony orchestras, *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 41, 337-369.
- Arts Council, England (2013) Our Mission <http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/> accessed 24th May 2014
- Austin, J., Stevenson, H., & Wei-Skillern, J. (2006) Social and commercial entrepreneurship: Same, different, or both? *Entrepreneurship Theory and Practice*, 30, 1–22.
- Atik, Y. (1992). Band on the couch, *Classical Musician*, 8, 19
- Baker, T. & Nelson, R. (2005) Creating something from nothing: Resource construction through entrepreneurial bricolage, *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 50, 329–366
- Besana, A. (2012) Alternative resources: Revenue diversification in the not-for-profit USA symphony orchestra, *The Journal of Arts Management, Law, and Society*, 49, 79-89.
- Borgaza, C. & Defourny, J. (2001) *The emergence of social enterprise*. New York: Routledge.
- Boyle, S. (2007) Impact of changes in organisational structure on selected key performance indicators for cultural organisations, *International Journal of Cultural Policy*, 13(3), 319-334.
- Boyle, S. and Throsby, D. (2012) Corporatisation, economic efficiency and the Australian symphony orchestras, *Economic Papers*, 31(1), 36-49.
- Brkic, A. (2009). Teaching arts management: Where did we lose the core idea? *The Journal of Arts Management, Law, and Society*, 38:4, 270-80.
- Brodsky, W. (2006) In the wings of British orchestras: A multiple-episode interview study among symphony players, *Journal of Occupational and Organisational Psychology*, 79, 673-690.
- Ciborra, C.U. (1996). The platform organization: Recombining strategies, structures and surprises. *Organization Science*, 7, 103–118.
- Cornwall, R. and Perlman, B. (1990) *Organizational Entrepreneurship*. Boston: Irwin.
- Defourny, J. and Spear, R. (1995) Economics of co-operation, in R. Spear and H. Voets (Eds.) *Success and Enterprise*, Avebury, Aldershot.
- Di Domenico, M.L., Haugh, H. and Tracey, P. (2010) Social Bricolage: Theorizing social value creation in social enterprise, *Entrepreneurship, Theory and Practice*, July, 681-703
- DiMaggio, P. (1987). *Managers of the arts: Careers and opinions of senior administrators of U.S. art museums, symphony orchestras, resident theatres, and local arts agencies*. Washington D. C.: Seven Locks Press.

- Dubina, H. (2013) Decomposing the precarious future of American orchestras in the face of Golan v. Holder, *UCLA Law Review*, 60 p.950-1005
- Hager, M. (2001) Financial vulnerability among arts organizations: A test of the Tuckman-Chang measures. *Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*, 30: 376.
- Hannan, M.T. and Freeman, J. (1977) The population ecology of organisations, *American Journal of Sociology*, 82, 929-964
- Hargreaves, I. (1999) In from the cold: Cooperatives and social exclusion, UK Co-operative Council, Manchester.
- Mariani, M.M., and Zan, L. (2011) The economy of music programs and organisations. A micro analysis and typology, *European Accounting Review*, 20(1), 113-148
- Mehner, K. (1990) Zwischen Neubeginn und Tradition, *Music und Gesellschaft*, 40, 247-252
- Mogelof, J.P. and Rohrer, L.H. (2005) Rewards and sacrifices in élite and non- élite organisations: Participation in valued activities and job satisfaction in two symphony orchestras, *International Journal of Manpower*, 26(1), 93-109.
- Möller, J.M. (1991) Knickrige Kulturation. Was Wird aus der Kunst in den Neuen Bundesländern? *Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung*, Nr. 299 (January 24) S. 26
- National Endowment for the Arts, (2007) *The arts and civic engagement: Involved in arts, involved in life* website <http://www.nea.gov/pub/civicingagement.pdf> accessed 16th May 2013
- Palmer I. (1998). Arts managers and managerialism: A cross-sector analysis of CEO's orientations and skills, *Public Productivity & Management Review*. 21:4, 433-452.
- Pomerantz, M. (2006) Rejuvenating liberal arts education through social entrepreneurship from <http://www.universitynetwork> retrieved April 22, 2011
- Pompe, J, Tamburri, L. and Munn, J. (2011) Factors that influence programming decisions of US symphony orchestras, *J Cult Econ*, 35, 167-184.
- Rosenbaum, L. (2011) Financial Shakeout: Do we need fewer arts organizations? www.artsjournal.com/culturegrl/2011/01/financial_shakeout_do_we_need.html retrieved April 20, 2011
- Seddon, F. A. (2004) 'Empathetic creativity: the product of empathetic attunement'. In Miell, D and Littleton, K. (Eds.) *Collaborative Creativity*, Free Association Books: London, 65-78.
- Seddon, F. A. (2005) Modes of communication during jazz improvisation, *British Journal of Music Education*, 22(1), 1-15
- Seddon, F. A. (2012) Empathetic Creativity in Music Making. In Odena, O. and Welch, G. (Eds.) *Musical Creativity: Insights from Music Education Research*, Ashgate: London, 133-147.

Seddon, F. A. and Biasutti, M. (2009a) 'A Comparison of Modes of Communication between members of a String Quartet and a Jazz Sextet', *Psychology of Music*, 37(4), 395-415

Seddon, F. A. and Biasutti, M. (2009b) 'Modes of Communication between members of a String Quartet', *Small Group Research*, 40, (2), 115-137

Smith, T. S., & Murphy, R. J. (1984) Conflicting criteria of success in the careers of symphony musicians, *Empirical Studies of the Arts*, 2, 149–172

Spear, R. (2000) The co-operative advantage, *Annals of Public and Cooperative Economics*, 71(4), 507-523.

Sternbach, D. (1993b). Stress in the lives of musicians – on and off stage. In A. Bejjani (Ed.), *Current research in arts medicine*, Acapella Books, 475–478)

Social Enterprise Alliance USA, from http://www.se-alliance.org/about_vision.cfm retrieved March 1, 2011

Tushman, M.L. and Anderson, P. (1986) Technological discontinuities and organisational environments, *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 31, 439-465

Weick, K.E. (1995). *Sensemaking in organizations*, Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Zimmer, D.E. (1990) Wenn Humpty Dumpty zerbricht, Vorschlaege zur Rettung der Ehermaligen DDR-Kultur, *Die Zeit* Nr 52 (December 21)