

*A lens comparison of Vocational Education and Training in the beauty sectors in
Taiwan and the UK*

I-Chun Hsiao, Emily Baines

De Montfort University, UK

0240

The Asian Conference on Education 2013

Official Conference Proceedings 2013

Abstract

A number of studies have highlighted the importance of effective interaction between vocational education and industry in nurturing professionals. A common strategy is to build a partnership between industry and education to ensure that graduates meet the requirements of industry, in preparation for employment.

Using a lens comparison approach, which provides the capability to draw on ethnographic experiences, this paper explores and compares the relationship between industry and vocational education in the beauty sectors of Taiwan and the UK. The overall method included observation, informal interviews and documentation analysis.

Significant differences were found not only in culture and levels of vocational education structure, but also in the unified standard and levels of skill formation, which are key points in preparing graduates' confidence and competence. In Taiwan, the lack of a body with responsibility for regulations, the overlapping levels in qualifications and ineffective communication between education and industry have led to beauty graduates lacking confidence in their ability, adversely impacting on their aspirations. Whereas, in the UK, based on a unified structure, the learners' educational and working experiences are recognised by both education and industry. Findings from this study will be beneficial for curriculum design and individual career development in this field and may also form a broader concept for use in other fields.

Keywords: Vocational Education and Training, Beauty, Industry, Competence

1. Introduction

This paper outlines the different approaches to nurturing beauty professionals in Taiwan and the UK, to identify important features necessary to develop a beauty professional's competence. A gap exists between education and industry in the Taiwanese beauty sector (Tsai 2003), which may be causing graduates to lack confidence in their employability. This is supported by survey evidence that also indicates the competence level of Higher Education (HE) graduates falls short of industrial requirements, in Taiwan (Wu & Lin 2010). This point is also strengthened by interviews of Taiwanese industrial experts, indicating that the overall employability of HE graduates from beauty programmes is low, due to their inadequate training and lack of aesthetic appreciation. There is increasing concern that some beauty professionals are being disadvantaged due to the demand of the beauty market changing from beautifying to greater emphasis on high-tech and medical procedures. These changes have occurred more quickly than the establishment could react (Yang et al. 2005): to overcome such challenges, close collaboration between education and industry has become essential. These issues have revealed the impact of the fragmented nature of the Vocational Education and Training (VET) system and the ineffective communication between education and industry in Taiwan. Tsai (2003) suggests that it is necessary to promote mutually beneficial collaboration between education and industry, so that, for instance, the educational sector provides knowledge of theory to industry, whilst industry offers training and skills updates.

The Taiwanese government has declared the objective of ensuring a seamless transition from education to employment. In order to achieve this, funding projects such as 'The Last Mile Program' (Zhou, 2013:p98), 'Team teaching' (Chen, 2011; Zhou, 2013), the 'Industry-University Cooperation Program (Ministry Of Education (MOE), 2012; Xu, 2013)' and so forth, have demonstrated their intentions. These projects aim to bring industrial elements into academia and lecturers have been requested to gain up-to-date practice in industry. It is believed that not only will these projects prepare graduates' competence for employment, but also improve the lecturers' industrial experience, as two thirds of technological college/university lecturers lack this (Chang, 2012), but there is no long term scheme to facilitate such collaborations. The unemployment rate in Taiwan has remained high and employers claim that they cannot find the required talents (Zhang, 2013), which may suggest that government policies merely treat the symptoms instead of remedying the underlying problem.

According to Zhuang (2007), the UK has pioneered the development of Vocational Education and Training (VET) systems. Examining the UK VET system, it may be seen that the relationship between education and industry has been broadly coordinated through government and professional bodies, although a technical skills gap is still evident (Habia 2007). However, document analysis indicates that skill gaps identified in the UK have been filled by including new updated knowledge/techniques into educational curricula and/or industrial training. Wu (2011) argues that Taiwan may learn from the UK's experience of developing its VET system, making the UK a suitable case study.

1.1 The beauty profession

The interest of this study has fallen on beauty, beauty practice and beauty professionals, three significant and closely-linked elements of the beauty profession. The beauty professional transmits the message of ideal beauty through their beauty practices. A broad term 'beauty profession' is employed in this study because it is commonly used to cover a heterogeneous range of practices. The 'beauty practitioner/professional' in the beauty related industries is generally known as a 'Beauty Therapist', 'Beautician/Cosmetologist', 'Make-up Artist' or 'Hairdresser'. Gimlin (2002) uses the sociological term 'body worker' to categorise these practitioners, due to their role being to work on the transformation of the human body and mind. This has also been defined as 'emotional labour' and 'aesthetic labour' in social analysis (Toerien & Kitzinger 2007; Black & Sharma 2001; Black 2004). Although beauty practice is usually considered to be an occupation, not a profession, Sheen (2006) argues it could be a profession in the future.

Recently, there has been increased interest in the beauty industry with a few studies identifying that the beauty salon holds a vital social position closely linked to culture, beauty and health (Felicia et al. 2004; Black 2004). The level of intimacy and interaction between practitioner and client, reflects the trust within this profession and the beauty salon has also been identified as a suitable environment to deliver health messages through trained and licensed cosmetologists (Linnan et al. 2001; Felicia et al. 2004). A key feature that has been studied is the dialogue between the beauty professional and the customer (Toerien & Kitzinger 2007).

To date, there has been little discussion of what 'beauty practice' actually involves. The rapid development of technology has also shaped the beauty industry and diverse new technological equipment has been developed as beauty aids for non-invasive surgery, whilst cosmetic surgery is more affordable than a decade ago. For example, Microneedle Therapy System (MTS) or microdermabrasion, requiring different levels of invasion of the skin (Keris Advanced Beauty Clinic 2011), may be performed by qualified therapists or cosmetologists. Similarly, permanent cosmetics/make-up involves skin penetration, which brings risks if undertaken by unqualified beauty therapists or make-up artists. Such treatments will require practitioners to have advanced knowledge, operating skills and a certain level of professional judgement. Also, biotechnological developments have been applied to cosmetics requiring beauty professionals to upgrade their knowledge of products and usage, to maximise the benefit of using these products.

Therapeutic beauty approaches may include holistic therapy and complementary and alternative medicine therapy, which provide an alternative beauty remedy option, either in spas and/or beauty clinics. Some of the treatments are medically involved: therefore, they need to be performed by qualified beauty therapists either unsupervised or under some degree of supervision. However, the complexity of this work may have been overlooked and the therapists' education and training journey may also have been undervalued. This is demonstrated by media and other reports of controversy over beauty practices (TVBS 2012a; Hayt 2002; Adams 2002). The beauty practitioners' competence has been questioned as their training is, in fact, frequently inadequate and the argument raised by Adam (2002) and Brody et. al. (2003) is whether supervision is truly carried out by medical professionals and

whether beauty practitioners are actually competent, or authorised, to carry out procedures. Both the beauty industry and the medical profession have taken advantage of these ambiguous boundaries (Brody et al. 2003), leaving the public vulnerable.

According to Habia's report (2007), the UK beauty industry is female dominated, as in Taiwan, and is mostly micro-businesses or self-employment. The report also addresses a major issue in the beauty industry: that employers cannot afford the cost of training, especially the employee time away from the workplace, even though most employers agree that training is important for business growth. A further difficulty is that the self-employed may not be aware of their own training needs to maintain the currency of their knowledge and competence. These needs could be met through Continuing Professional Development (CPD) programmes provided by professional bodies and/or learning institutions, thus improving the prospects of addressing concerns over professional competence and entitlement to practice. So, the success of the application of beauty relies on the beauty professional's ability, which needs to be kept up-to-date through on-going professional development.

1.2 Overview of beauty education and industry in Taiwan

Taiwanese government policy has relaxed educational regulations since 1996, permitting technical colleges to upgrade to technological university status and allowing more practical-based learners to progress into higher education: however, this rapid reform has also caused an imbalance between quality and quantity in vocational education (Chang, n.d.; Huang, n.d.; Zheng, 2007). Zhang (2012) questions whether a higher education is actually necessary in some occupations, citing the beauty industry as an example. Wang (2013) suggests that this rapid expansion of higher vocational education has led to an over-supply of over-educated employees.

In Taiwan, the beauty education field has developed rapidly due to demand in the labour market since inception in 1974 (Xu 1996; Chen & Lin 2007), but the first beauty skill certification did not appear until 1991, since when it has gradually become too dominant a feature despite its lack of currency (Yeh & Chen 2006). There is a similar curriculum standard across the Further Education (FE) sector, established by the Ministry of Education in Taiwan (Chen & Lin 2007). The curriculum design in the HE (Higher Technological and Vocational Education: HTVE) sector overlaps with FE. This research indicates that the scope of the HE and FE beauty curricula is broad and lacks depth compared to the UK. The current established beauty programmes in HTVE may be categorised into three main domains: cosmetic sciences; cosmetology and styling; beauty and health related programmes. Although each domain claims its own features and the flexibility to develop its own characteristics, the curriculum is rather similar across all the categories, but contains a small proportion of specialised subjects. For instance, cosmetology and styling-related modules can be seen in the curriculum of cosmetic science and vice versa.

The supply from beauty education and the demand from the beauty industry are not synchronised (Tsai 2003). Also, teaching professionals' field experience has been criticized as inadequate (Chen, 2000; Huang, 2003; Wang, 2013), which may lead to a gap between industry and academia, resulting in graduates lacking confidence when

entering the job market. Hong and Huang (2003) and Hsu (2003) have reviewed Taiwanese beauty education in comparison with Japanese aesthetic education and revealed that beauty education in Taiwan is lacking cultural and aesthetic components, which tends to reinforce the opinion of industrial experts who state that graduates lack aesthetic appreciation, as found by this study. Chen et.al (2006) argue that the sense of aesthetics and cultural understanding should be an important component of being a beauty professional. This paper suggests that the ability to convey the ethos of aesthetics to the client through beauty practice is fundamental to this profession.

Due to the focus on skill training, the theoretical and practical knowledge behind techniques has been paid very little attention. The lack of in-depth knowledge related to the subject has also limited the development of the profession, whilst the training also lacks a holistic perspective. Learners may be able to perform techniques, but the entirety of the task is more than just skills. With holistic training, beauty graduates should be able to perform an entire service including communicating with clients, consulting and identifying clients' needs, planning and performing one or more treatments with a rational sequence and providing appropriate care advice. They also need to be able to respond to and take appropriate action if an incident and/or accident occurs in the workplace.

The consumption patterns of Taiwanese consumers are fast moving (Hung 2006): this characteristic was also recognised by the research interviewees, who commented that the beauty industry required constant changes in the beauty packages offered. Zeng (2009) points out that vicious price competition in the beauty industry has distorted service quality, resulting in increased risks to customers and reduced profit margins. So far, however, very little is found in the literature on the issue. The lack of enforced regulation in this field inevitably aggravates the risks of dubious practices in the beauty sector. At the same time, beauty practice has evolved from simple skin care/make-up advice to hi-tech and/or medically involved treatments, so beauty professionals should upgrade their competence accordingly (Zeng 2009).

1.3 Overview of beauty education and industry in the UK

The VET system in the UK provides various options and flexible learning structures for school leavers to choose their career pathway. In 2010, there was a reform of the UK qualification framework, which changed from the National Qualifications Framework (NQF) to the Qualifications and Credit Framework (QCF) (Harris 2010). The QCF aims to provide a flexible, transferable and recognisable qualification system (Blinko 2011). QCF starts from entry level to level 8 and each level comprises units, which contain credit values (QCDA 2010). However, an analysis from Lester (2011) argues that there are issues over the integration of HE and the professional qualification system within the QCF.

In FE, Hair and Beauty, which are two major sectors of the beauty industry, are divided into two distinctive training programmes of Beauty Therapy (including makeup and nail technology related qualifications) and Hairdressing. Beauty Therapy was launched by City and Guilds of London Institute in 1970 (Taylor 2000, p5). In the UK, the standard of beauty education and industry codes of practice are established by the Hair and Beauty Industry Authority (Habia) appointed by the UK

government (Habia 2007). A variety of awarding bodies, such as City & Guilds (C&G), Vocational Training Charitable Trust (VTCT) and Edexcel, awards different types and levels of vocational qualification, such as National Vocational Qualifications (NVQs), Vocational Related Qualifications (VRQs) and Higher National Certificate (HNC)/ Higher National Diploma (HND). However, all these qualifications are developed based on National Occupational Standards (NOS), which are the benchmarks developed by industry and other stakeholders for describing the competence required of an individual to accomplish good practice when performing a task in the workplace (NOS 2013). It is also strongly recommended and promoted that NOS should be implemented at the HE level of vocational qualifications (Swales et al. 2004). The progression route to HE for beauty related programmes is mainly offered at sub-degree level, such as HNC, HND, Foundation degrees (Fds), and at undergraduate degree level (NARIC 2005). The top-up final year at degree level is available after taking sub-degree level courses, in order to complete a bachelor's degree, awarded by HE institutions.

The upgrading of beauty education and training in 2001 has been an important step to open up the HE route to FE graduates (Gallacher et al. 2012; Anderson & Hemsworth 2005). The beauty related HE route is more advanced and specialised in related subject areas, such as Advanced Beauty Therapy, management related programmes such as Salon or Spa Management and Make-up Studies in the theatre, TV and films. Those programmes are included within the 'more applied subjects' (Hoelscher et al., 2008:p145), which are mostly set up as a sub-degree in the FE sector. The availability of specialised technical equipment, facilities and human resources in FE, dictates that the majority of HE beauty programmes take place in local FE colleges (Bathmaker et al. 2008; Parry et al. 2012). Yet, it is still debatable whether this progression opportunity is a valuable investment for FE graduates. Parry et al. (2012) revealed that the 2008-2010 results from The National Student Survey (NSS) show that there is low satisfaction from the HE learners in an FE setting.

The quality of assessment is also assured by external and internal verifiers to ensure standards are maintained during training. Based on the agreed standard implemented into learning outcomes and performance criteria of these vocational qualifications, beauty practices should be performed in a very similar fashion across sectors, even though the application may vary according to the type of treatment/design. More importantly, the skills and knowledge are transferrable because this recognised standard can be applied to different organisations. In order to ensure that the practice standard is maintained at a professional level, professional bodies provide short courses/activities for professionals to update and maintain their competence (Lester 1999).

There is also collaboration between education and industry, which has been embodied in Apprenticeships (Brockmann et al. 2010), Work-Based Learning modules/programmes (Brennan 2005) and work placements. Due to the use of NOS, the competence of learners may be assessed in the workplace, by internal or external assessors, and to meet the standard, employer input must adhere to a similar training framework as the education sector. But it is also suggested by Little et al. (2003) that employers need to engage more in VET and be aware of changes to qualifications and policies.

In the UK, all training programmes in education and industry have to be developed based on NOS and the regulations related to hygiene, health and safety relevant to treatment(s) must also be complied with. A core aspect of the teaching is that learners form a habit of performing all tasks from planning through operation to completion, as a complete process, rather than thinking of each skill as a complete procedure. In the salon setting at the institutions, the practice must be supervised, follow the code of practice and meet all the regulations, including health and safety. The customer is clearly informed that the service is part of a taught course, which is performed under supervision. The purpose is to encourage learners to work on a real paying client in preparation for employment.

This brief review shows that although the ultimate aim of the UK and Taiwanese VET systems is to produce competent beauty practitioners, there are significant differences in how this objective is approached by the respective governments, educational bodies and industry stakeholders.

2. Research methods

'Lens comparison' (Walk 1998) was employed because both countries' VET systems are very different. The objective of this study is to find a strategy to improve Taiwanese beauty professional's competence. UK professional qualifications such as International Vocational Qualifications (IVQs) have been introduced to Taiwan and suggested as an extra qualification alongside the main qualification, apart from the national skill certificate. Understanding the UK's approach of nurturing beauty professionals was chosen as the framework for reviewing Taiwan's VET system. It was considered that the best method to adopt for this investigation was to use the concept of ethnography to gain inside knowledge of the UK's VET structure, based on a previous personal learning background and working experience in the beauty field in Taiwan. Since the ethnographer is claimed as the most important instrument in this type of method (Fetterman 2010), the ethnographer with a full set of experiences in the field could be considered as an asset to this project, even though this study is more of an ethnographic experience than ethnographic research itself. In order to establish a holistic view of how the VET system in the UK prepares the beauty professional's competence, participant observation was a suitable form of action (Atkinson & Hammersley 1994).

The ethnographic participation that occurred in different settings included observation and a series of unstructured informal interviews. In the education institutions, teaching and learning, cultural differences, attitudes, assessment measures and so forth were considered, including in the role of the participant, learner, lecturer and assessor. While in the industrial setting, the analysis of work experiences in beauty salons, theatres, studio and location photo shoots during employment, freelance and voluntary work were included. The comparative analysis occurred throughout this ethnographic experience within both formal and informal environments over an extended period. This approach has not previously been used in the beauty field. Prior and subsequent to the unstructured informal interviews, formal interviews and document analysis were employed to complement the participant observation.

The subject groups studied in the participant observation include FE and HE beauty learners, practitioners and professionals in education and industry in the UK. The

identification of the ethnographer as being a participant and a research student was, to some extent, acknowledged by others, but very few people were interested in the research itself. Meanwhile, document analysis of curricula, programme specifications, performance criteria and so forth was adopted to compare the structure of the beauty programme and the training approach in both countries. Semi-structured interviews and formal observations were also undertaken in the Taiwanese beauty education and industry sectors.

3. Discussion

Findings from the review and analysis of documents indicate differences between Taiwan and UK's VET systems, shown in the figure below, demonstrating that the UK's QCF is more straightforward and flexible. Each stage of the qualification framework is denoted as a 'level' (QAA 2008). The learners have a choice to stop or continue their learning journey without much overlap: whereas, in Taiwan, the qualifications are larger and without interim awards, which does not give learners such flexibility to manage their career. In addition, entrance requirements in Taiwan are mainly based on written examinations: therefore, learners coming from a mixed background increase the challenges for teachers, forming a barrier to the delivery of advanced skill training (Yang et al. 2005). Also, the curriculum of beauty education, in Taiwan, covers greater breadth in hair, skin care and make-up: whereas, in the UK, the curriculum has demonstrated more depth and progression between levels.

Taiwan educational structure		Level	UK educational structure
4-year HTVE	2-year Senior College		Level 6 (BA)
	2-year Junior College		Level 5 (Fd/HND)
3-year Vocational High School (VHS)		5-year Junior College	Level 4 (HNC)
			Level 3
		FE	Level 2
			Level 1

* Source: The researcher constructed the diagram according to literature from Ministry of Education in Taiwan and the UK Qualifications Credit Framework (QCF)

The approach in teaching and learning is also very different. For instance, in Taiwan, teaching and learning has greater focus on delivering skill itself, rather than the entire service task. The practising of skills is sometimes a 'performance' and used only as a means of passing the national skill certification, which Huang (n.d.) describes as distorting the VET system and has been criticised as outdated and failing to measure the competence of a professional (Yeh & Chen 2006; TVBS 2012b). Skills, knowledge and attitude should be embodied within the entire service task, which may then form the core of the taught content, including compliance with health and safety. To a large extent, in the UK, the safe and effective conduct of beauty practice is regulated through legislation, regulations and codes of practice, which is reflected in the teaching. However, in Taiwan, insufficient emphasis is placed on habituating learners to consider and perform health and safety procedures as a fundamental component of the transformation process. Consequently, the Taiwanese beauty sector has been practising and surviving within a controversial grey zone, with regard to the quality and safety of delivery of services (üho 2013; TVBS 2012b).

From ethnographic experiences in the UK, the current training approach for beauty practitioners can be discussed in three major respects. Firstly, the progression route

from FE to HE offers beauty practitioners more advanced theoretical knowledge and practical skills, although there is very little discussion about the transition from FE to HE. The identified skill shortages and gaps have been addressed within education and training programmes (Habia 2007), so education does respond to industrial needs. Also, practitioners can update their skills through CPD courses provided through the professional bodies or by upgrading to a higher level within the QCF structure to obtain, or maintain, their career development and employment.

Secondly, the approach to assessment reflects the teaching and learning. The learning environment may not necessarily be in a (simulated) workplace, but the assessment will be required to perform as if it were. Learners may be assessed by lecturers or any assessor provided they are qualified to assess the subjects. In this case, standardisation in teaching and assessment across the board appears more significant, as the standardisation is not only for minimising differences between lecturers and assessors, but also requires the sharing of good practices between staff. Learners may appeal if they disagree with the assessment result: this requires re-assessment by a different assessor, thus helping to ensure quality assurance of assessment.

The third aspect is that techniques and theoretical knowledge are embedded in the teaching of treatment procedures complying with health and safety considerations. This training, recognised within industry, concerns not only an ability to perform techniques, but also a competence to complete the entire task, in a safe manner. The training structure allows learners to apply their knowledge and skills to real world practice, which helps to build a graduate's confidence.

The skills at different educational levels involve varying degrees of complexity and show a progressive structure. For example, facial treatment at Beauty Therapy Level 2 only requires the performance of the manual skill, but Level 3 develops this manual skill to incorporate the use of electrical equipment. Upgrading to Level 4 and 5 involves hi-tech or medical equipment such as laser and light treatments for skin rejuvenation, which require in-depth physiology and dermatology knowledge. The preparation, consultation and care advice also involve different levels of complexity. Additionally, a service could incorporate more than one treatment, further challenging the practitioner's competence.

By comparison, in Taiwan, through observing professionals' performance in the workplace, it was found that there was a lack of standardisation in the service processes and approaches. As a result, service structure and quality in the workplace may appear to vary. This diversity increases uncertainty and demands pre-job training by employers. Thus, from an ethnographic viewpoint, without pre-job training from the employer, the practitioners may experience a feeling of incompetence. The professionals can execute a treatment, but may not necessarily be able to perform a consultation, or even a contra-indication check to prevent exacerbating a skin condition and preventing infection and/or cross-infection. The research findings confirm that training at institutions focuses more on techniques than the ability to execute an entire task. However, a number of companies, such as SHISEIDO and Kenyon in Taiwan, have developed their own independent standardised service procedures, but these may not be transferable. In addition, in Taiwan, an awareness of health and safety procedures has not been embedded successfully into the curriculum,

to engender graduates' appreciation of the importance of these issues during their career, because the regulations are not specifically highlighted to the beauty learners.

The curriculum design in Taiwan for beauty programmes gives a breadth of knowledge and skills, but the lack of depth results in graduates' competence appearing too generalised. The student has limited interest in theory and their lack of academic ability disadvantages their professional development. Also, the work placement to develop their professional competence, can have limited effectiveness due to its method of implementation. From the evidence of the semi-structured interviews and ethnographic experience, a successful collaboration depends on both stakeholders having an equal contribution. Work placements in Taiwan can be seen as having a reduced value due to a lack of input from employers, but education providers should be more pro-active in understanding industrial needs and future trends in order to prepare and negotiate training opportunities. Improvements to work placement should enhance the beauty graduates' confidence and employability, whilst also providing benefits to the industry and clients, thus addressing elements of the problems outlined above.

To summarise, the lack of standards and regulations for the Taiwanese beauty industry suggests a predominantly laissez-faire attitude on the part of the government, shifting responsibility onto beauty practitioners. Ethnographic experience, in the UK, indicates that an effective policy would be to establish an impartial Taiwanese professional body to regulate the related beauty associations, effectively monitor practices, identify the needs of industry and improve communication between education and industry. Furthermore, implementing protocols for learners to integrate theory into practice through their learning journey and experience working in and managing a simulated workplace could help learners to become familiar with a real working environment.

4. Conclusion

The research recognises the existence of a gap between what Taiwanese beauty education provides and what the beauty industry requires from graduates. In the UK, government triangulates professional bodies, education and industry to develop training programmes and practice based on the same standard, with an audit mechanism to ensure that quality of training and practice are maintained. This approach could be adopted in Taiwan to promote an individual's life-long learning opportunity and career. It is recommended that an authorised professional body is established, the benefit of which is to utilise its resources to identify industry needs and monitor industry practice. Every practitioner/professional should register with the professional body and their practice should be monitored. Also, the professional body may play a role as liaison between education and industry and it could provide courses for professionals to update their competence. The Taiwanese government has made an effort to fund additional projects alongside the main qualification to prepare graduates' competence in their subject field. However, it may be ineffective if that which is learned by beauty graduates is not recognised by and transferable into industry.

From the findings, the development and establishment of a national occupational standard that specifically fits the Taiwanese cultural features, educational structure

and industrial setting would provide an effective guidance for education providers. The standard would be embedded in the curriculum of the VET programme and applied to develop its structure into different progressive levels to ensure that different levels of talent are cultivated. The development of taught content should aim to effectively habituate learners to think holistically and consider, appreciate and perform aesthetic theory, skill and health and safety.

The above should be promoted to industry, to ensure that education practices and standards are transferrable to industry and integrated into real world practice. These recommendations may overcome the core issues of Taiwanese beauty graduates lacking confidence in their employability and employers not being satisfied with the graduates' competence.

5. References

- Adams, M.E., 2002. Body Authorities: Clinicism, Experts, and the Science of Beauty. *The Journal of American Culture*, 25(3-4), pp.282–289.
- Anderson, A. & Hemsworth, D., 2005. *Higher Education for Hairdressing and Beauty Sector Professionals*, University Vocational Awards Council
- Atkinson, P. & Hammersley, M., 1994. Ethnography and Participant Observation. In N. Denzin & Y. Lincoln, eds. *Handbook of Qualitative Research*. London: Sage, pp. 248–260.
- Bathmaker, A.-M. et al., 2008. Dual-sector further and higher education: policies, organisations and students in transition. *Research Papers in Education*, 23(2), pp.125–137.
- Black, P., 2004. *The Beauty Industry: Gender, Culture, Pleasure*, London: Routledge.
- Black, P. & Sharma, U., 2001. Men are real, Women are “made up”: beauty therapy and the construction of femininity. *The Sociological Review*, 49(1), pp.100–116. Available at: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/1467-954X.00246>.
- Blinko, L., 2011. New employer-led vocational qualifications now available. *British Journal of Healthcare Assistants*, 5(3), pp.141–143. Available at: <http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=rzh&AN=2010999112&site=ehost-live>.
- Brennan, L., 2005. *Integrating Work-Based Learning into Higher Education: A guide to Good Practice*,
- Brockmann, M., Clarke, L. & Winch, C., 2010. The Apprenticeship Framework in England: a new beginning or a continuing sham? *Journal of Education and Work*, 23(2), pp.111–127.
- Brody, H.J., Geronemus, R.G. & Farris, P.K., 2003. Beauty Versus Medicine: The Nonphysician Practice of Dermatologic Surgery. *Dermatologic Surgery*, 29(4), pp.319–324. Available at: <http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=aph&AN=9386948&site=ehost-live>.
- Chang, Y.-N., 高等技職教育體制改革之探討 (The Study on System Reform of Higher Technological and Vocational Education). , pp.1–18.
- Chen, G.-F., 2000. 美容教育的省思. 技藝教育, 28, pp.23–25.
- Chen, L.-W. et al., 2006. An Analysis of the Development of Beauty and Hairdressing Industry from the Point of View of Technology Education. *Ling Tung Academic Research of General Education*, 1(3), pp.1–14.
- Chen, L.-W. & Lin, J.-C., 2007. Investigating The Analysis of Establishing The Beauty Business Industry. *The Journal of International Esthetic Science*, 4(2), pp.104–112.
- Chen, W.-Y., 2011. When academy meets industry: A case study of team teaching between academic and industrial teachers. In *Technology Management in the Energy Smart World (PICMET), 2011 Proceedings of PICMET '11*: pp. 1–5.
- Felicia, M.S. et al., 2004. Observational Study in Ten Beauty Salons: Results Informing Development of the North Carolina BEAUTY and Health Project. *Health Education & Behavior*, 31(6), pp.790–807. Available at: <http://ejournals.ebsco.com/direct.asp?ArticleID=498C98C88156A971E35A>.
- Fetterman, D.M., 2010. *Ethnography: Step by step* 3rd ed., London: Sage.

- Gallacher, J., Ingram, R. & Reeve, F., 2012. Are Vocational Qualifications Vocational? In M. Pilz, ed. *The Future of Vocational Education and Training in a Changing World*. VS Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften, pp. 381–401.
- Gimlin, D.L., 2002. *Body work: beauty and self-image in American culture*, Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Habia, 2007. *Habia Skills Survey of the Beauty Therapy Industry*, Doncaster. Available at: http://www.habia.org/uploads/Bty_Report_Final_v3_210607_-_20_July_2007.pdf.
- Harris, S., 2010. Out with the NVQs, in with the diplomas. *Nursing & Residential Care*, 12(12), pp.569–571.
- Hayt, E., 2002. Whose Hand Holds the Laser? *New York Times*, CLI(52,032), p.9.
- Hoelscher, M. et al., 2008. The transition from vocational education and training to higher education: a successful pathway? *Research Papers in Education*, 23(2), pp.139–151. Available at: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/02671520802048679>.
- Hong, J.-X. & Huang, Y.-C., 2003. Taiwanese Esthetic Education in Respond to Japanese Esthetic Scientific Education. *Economics, Journal of Chinese Home*, 33, pp.43–56.
- Hsu, M.-R., 2003. Remarks on Distinguishing Features of Educational Institutions and Business Related to Cosmetology in Japan. *Educational Research & Information*, 11(3), pp.113–132.
- Huang, W.-Z., 在校生技能檢定政策對高職實習教學之影響. , pp.1–14. Available at: <http://aca4.saihs.edu.tw/pps/download/03-06.pdf> [Accessed March 13, 2010].
- Huang, Y.-C., 2003. *Analysis of the Professional Competencies of Manager in the Beauty Saloon*. 國立台灣師範大學.
- Huang, Z.-F., 淺論我國技職教育的發展. Available at: <http://www.shs.edu.tw/works/essay/2010/10/2010103116513949.pdf> [Accessed October 11, 2013].
- Hung, Y.-C., 2006. *The Future Trend Moving Fast Goods Consumer*. National Sun Yat-sen University.
- Keris Advanced Beauty Clinic, 2011. Treatments. Available at: <http://www.kerisclinic.co.nz/treatment> [Accessed October 28, 2013].
- Lester, S., 1999. Professional bodies , CPD and informal learning : the case of conservation. *Continuing professional Development*, 3(4), pp.110–121.
- Lester, S., 2011. The UK Qualifications and Credit Framework: a critique. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training*, 63(2), pp.205–216. Available at: <http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13636820.2011.560394>.
- Linnan, L.A. et al., 2001. Working with Licensed Cosmetologists to Promote Health: Results from the North Carolina BEAUTY and Health Pilot Study. *Preventive Medicine*, 33(6), pp.606–612. Available at: <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0091743501909338>.
- Little, B. et al., 2003. *Vocational higher education - does it meet employers' needs?* Unknown, ed., London.
- Ministry Of Education (MOE), 2012. 教育部推動產學攜手合作計畫2013. , pp.1–113.

- NARIC, 2005. Description of Higher Education in England, Wales and Northern Ireland. *UK NARIC*. Available at: http://www.ecctis.co.uk/europass/documents/ds_description.pdf.
- NOS, 2013. Introduction to National Occupational Standards. *National Occupational Standards (NOS)*, pp.1–4. Available at: http://nos.ukces.org.uk/eguides/eguide_introduction_to_nos.pdf [Accessed October 21, 2013].
- Parry, G. et al., 2012. *Understanding Higher Education in Further Education Colleges*, London.
- QAA, 2008. The framework for higher education qualifications in England, Wales and Northern Ireland. *The Quality Assurance Agency (QAA)*, (August), pp.1–47. Available at: <http://www.qaa.ac.uk/Publications/InformationandGuidance/Documents/FHEQ08.pdf> [Accessed September 4, 2012].
- QCDA, 2010. The Qualifications and Credit Framework (QCF) and higher education: Working together to benefit learners Contents. *Qualifications and Curriculum Development Agency (QCDA)*, pp.1–36. Available at: http://www.linklondon.ac.uk/downloads/cats/QCF_HE_brochure_web.pdf [Accessed August 21, 2012].
- Sheen, J.G., 2006. *The professionalisation of aromatherapy: a case study of the professionalisation of complementary and alternative medicine in the Australian health care system*. Lismore: Southern Cross University.
- Swales, S., Roodhouse, S. & Hemsworth, D., 2004. *A Higher Education Context for National Occupational Standards*, Available at: http://www.uvac.ac.uk/wp-content/uploads/2010/08/s_wailes_NOS_report_final1.pdf.
- Taylor, R.W., 2000. *The Place of Underpinning Knowledge and Understanding in National Vocational Qualifications : A Case Study in Beauty Therapy A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy University of Huddersfield Dec.* University of Huddersfield.
- Toerien, M. & Kitzinger, C., 2007. II. Emotional Labour in the Beauty Salon. *Feminism & Psychology*, 17(2), pp.162–172. Available at: <http://fap.sagepub.com/content/17/2/162.abstract>.
- Tsai, Y.-R., 2003. 美容從業人員教育訓練與生涯發展. National Chung Cheng University.
- TVBS, 2012a. 〈獨家〉美容師若無使用證照 擅用醫材恐違法. Available at: http://www.tvbs.com.tw/news/news_list.asp?no=anita198920120316190338 [Accessed April 8, 2012].
- TVBS, 2012b. 考題21年沒變！盼分類提升美容專業. *TVBS*. Available at: <http://news.tvbs.com.tw/entry/11747>.
- üho, 2013. 婦人雷射洗眼線打破視網膜險失明. *Yahoo*.
- Walk, K., 1998. How to Write a Comparative Analysis. *Harvard University*. Available at: <http://writingcenter.fas.harvard.edu/pages/how-write-comparative-analysis> [Accessed April 15, 2011].
- Wang, J.-L., 2013. 漸進推動課程學位分流. *Higher Education, Technological & Vocational Education Newsletter*, pp.1–3. Available at: http://www.news.high.edu.tw/pages_d.php?fn=topic&id=398 [Accessed October 7, 2013].

- Wu, C.-K. & Lin, T.-C., 2010. A Theoretical Reflection on the Development of Higher Technological & Vocational Education in Taiwan. *Bulletin of National Institute of Education Resources and Research*, 47, pp.1–24.
- Wu, R.-F., 2011. The Development of Vocational and Training System in the UK. *Bulletin of National Institute of Education Resources and Research*, 55, pp.103–128.
- Xu, G.-H., 2013. 產學合作發展方向之研析. *The Journal of Chaoyang University of Technology*, 18, pp.1–16. Available at:
[http://ir.lib.cyut.edu.tw:8080/retrieve/31827/1_%E6%9C%9D%E9%99%BD%E5%AD%B8%E5%A0%B1_%E8%A8%B1%E5%85%89%E8%8F%AF\(%E4%BF%AE\).pdf](http://ir.lib.cyut.edu.tw:8080/retrieve/31827/1_%E6%9C%9D%E9%99%BD%E5%AD%B8%E5%A0%B1_%E8%A8%B1%E5%85%89%E8%8F%AF(%E4%BF%AE).pdf).
- Xu, N.-X., 1996. 美容從業人員專業能力之研究. Taiwan: 中國文化大學.
- Yang, M.-Y., You, M. & Chen, F.-C., 2005. Competencies and qualifications for industrial design jobs: implications for design practice, education, and student career guidance. *Design Studies*, 26(2), pp.155–189. Available at: <http://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S0142694X04000651> [Accessed August 15, 2013].
- Yeh, J.-H. & Chen, M.-C., 2006. The Related Implementations and Characteristics of Professional Skill Certification for Cosmetology Department in Senior Secondary Education in Domestic. *Journal of Kaohsiung Hospitality College*, 8.
- Zeng, J.-M., 2009. Marketing Management of Professional Salons: From the Perspective of Service Characteristics. *The Journal of Esthetic Science*, 6(1), pp.214–232.
- Zhang, W.-C., 2012. 教育理念:技職教育出了什麼問題?. *CASEdu (國立臺灣大學科學教育發展中心)*, pp.2–3. Available at: http://case.ntu.edu.tw/CASEDU/casedu_uptest/?cat=13&paged=10 [Accessed October 14, 2013].
- Zhang, Z.-J., 2013. 課程分流大挑戰. *Higher Education, Technological & Vocational Education Newsletter*, pp.1–4. Available at: http://www.news.high.edu.tw/pages_d.php?fn=topic&id=396 [Accessed October 5, 2013].
- Zheng, L.-Q., 2007. 淺談我國技職教育現況問題. *Taipei County Education*, pp.87–88. Available at: <http://te.ntpc.edu.tw/ezfiles/6/1006/img/47/062-18.pdf> [Accessed October 11, 2013].
- Zhou, C.-D., 2013. 台灣推動產學合作的策略模式 – 產學研發與人才培育. *The Journal of Chaoyang University of Technology*, 18, pp.85–109. Available at:
http://ir.lib.cyut.edu.tw:8080/retrieve/31831/5_%E6%9C%9D%E9%99%BD%E5%AD%B8%E5%A0%B1_%E5%91%A8%E7%87%A6%E5%BE%B7.pdf [Accessed November 22, 2013].
- Zhuang, G.-Z., 2007. 英國技術與職業教育, Yunlin, Taiwan.

